

HONORABLE DAVID G. ESTUDILLO

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON
AT TACOMA

MARIUS GRIGORIU,

Plaintiff,

v.

ATLANTIC CASUALTY INSURANCE
COMPANY,

Defendant.

CASE NO. 3:23-cv-06114-DGE

ORDER GRANTING STIPULATED
MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER
(DKT. NO. 11)

1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this agreement is consistent with LCR 26(c). It does not confer blanket protection on all disclosures or responses to discovery, the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles, and it does not presumptively entitle parties to file confidential information under seal.

1 2. “CONFIDENTIAL” MATERIAL

2 “Confidential” material shall include the following documents and tangible things
 3 produced or otherwise exchanged: Plaintiff’s or Defendants’ internal policies and practices;
 4 information relating to underwriting procedures, including pricing and rating; internal claim
 5 analysis; claims handling guidelines; reserve information; reinsurance information, and
 6 information related to other insureds. “Confidential material” shall mean all such material
 7 designated by any party as “Confidential-Subject to Protective Order.”

8 The listing of specific types of documents is not an admission that such are relevant to this
 9 case or otherwise subject to discovery or admissible in evidence. Such listing simply indicates
 10 that if such production is required, it will be done pursuant to the terms of this Protective Order.

11 3. SCOPE

12 The protections conferred by this agreement cover not only confidential material (as
 13 defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from confidential material; (2) all
 14 copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of confidential material; and (3) any testimony,
 15 conversations, or presentations by parties or their counsel that might reveal confidential material.

16 However, the protections conferred by this agreement do not cover information that is in
 17 the public domain or becomes part of the public domain through trial or otherwise.

18 4. ACCESS TO AND USE OF CONFIDENTIAL MATERIAL

19 4.1 Basic Principles. A receiving party may use confidential material that is disclosed
 20 or produced by another party or by a non-party in connection with this case only for prosecuting,
 21 defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Confidential material may be disclosed only to the
 22 categories of persons and under the conditions described in this agreement. Confidential material
 23 must be stored and maintained by a receiving party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures
 24 that access is limited to the persons authorized under this agreement.

25 4.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered
 26 by the court or permitted in writing by the designating party, a receiving party may disclose any

1 confidential material only to:

2 (a) the receiving party's counsel of record in this action, as well as employees
3 of counsel to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this litigation;

4 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including in house counsel) of the
5 receiving party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation, unless the parties
6 agree that a particular document or material produced is for Attorney's Eyes Only and is so
7 designated;

8 (c) experts and consultants to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this
9 litigation and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

10 (d) the court, court personnel, and court reporters and their staff;

11 (e) copy or imaging services retained by counsel to assist in the duplication of
12 confidential material, provided that counsel for the party retaining the copy or imaging service
13 instructs the service not to disclose any confidential material to third parties and to immediately
14 return all originals and copies of any confidential material;

15 (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is
16 reasonably necessary and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound"
17 (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the designating party or ordered by the court. Pages of
18 transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal confidential material must
19 be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted
20 under this agreement;

21 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a
22 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

23 (h) Former partners, employees, officers, or agents of the parties who counsel,
24 in good faith, requires to provide assistance in the conduct of this lawsuit and who have signed the
25 "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

26 (i) Persons or entities to whom a Party has a contractual, legal or regulatory

obligation to provide confidential material, including insurers, reinsurers, reinsurance intermediaries, retrocessionaries, regulators, retrocessionary accountants and auditors of any Party; and

(j) Any person agreed to in writing by all Parties or allowed by the Court.

4.3 Filing Confidential Material. Before filing confidential material or discussing or referencing such material in court filings, the filing party shall confer with the designating party, in accordance with Local Civil Rule 5(g)(3)(A), to determine whether the designating party will remove the confidential designation, whether the document can be redacted, or whether a motion to seal or stipulation and proposed order is warranted. During the meet and confer process, the designating party must identify the basis for sealing the specific confidential information at issue, and the filing party shall include this basis in its motion to seal, along with any objection to sealing the information at issue. Local Civil Rule 5(g) sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal. A party who seeks to maintain the confidentiality of its information must satisfy the requirements of Local Civil Rule 5(g)(3)(B), even if it is not the party filing the motion to seal. Failure to satisfy this requirement will result in the motion to seal being denied, in accordance with the strong presumption of public access to the Court's files.

5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each party or non-party that designates information or items for protection under this agreement must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The designating party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify, so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this agreement.

Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are

1 shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (*e.g.*, to
2 unnecessarily encumber or delay the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses
3 and burdens on other parties) expose the designating party to sanctions.

4 If it comes to a designating party's attention that information or items that it designated for
5 protection do not qualify for protection, the designating party must promptly notify all other parties
6 that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

7 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this
8 agreement (see, *e.g.*, second paragraph of section 5.2(b) below), or as otherwise stipulated or
9 ordered, disclosure of discovery material that qualifies for protection under this agreement must
10 be clearly so designated before or when the material is disclosed or produced.

11 (a) Information in documentary form: (*e.g.*, paper or electronic documents and
12 deposition exhibits, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings),
13 the designating party must affix the words "CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE
14 ORDER" to each page that contains confidential material. If only a portion or portions of the
15 material on a page qualifies for protection, the producing party also must clearly identify the
16 protected portion(s) (*e.g.*, by making appropriate markings in the margins).

17 (b) Testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial proceedings: the parties
18 and any participating non-parties must identify on the record, during the deposition or other pretrial
19 proceeding, all protected testimony, without prejudice to their right to so designate other testimony
20 after reviewing the transcript. Any party or non-party may, within fifteen days after receiving the
21 transcript of the deposition or other pretrial proceeding, designate portions of the transcript, or
22 exhibits thereto, as confidential. If a party or non-party desires to protect confidential information
23 at trial, the issue should be addressed during the pre-trial conference.

24 (c) Other tangible items: the producing party must affix in a prominent place
25 on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the words
26 "CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER." If only a portion or portions of the

1 information or item warrant protection, the producing party, to the extent practicable, shall identify
2 the protected portion(s).

3 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to
4 designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the designating party's
5 right to secure protection under this agreement for such material. Upon timely correction of a
6 designation, the receiving party must make reasonable efforts to ensure that the material is treated
7 in accordance with the provisions of this agreement.

8 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

9 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any party or non-party may challenge a designation of
10 confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a designating party's confidentiality
11 designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic
12 burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a party does not waive its right to
13 challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the
14 original designation is disclosed.

15 6.2 Meet and Confer. The parties must make every attempt to resolve any dispute
16 regarding confidential designations without court involvement. Any motion regarding confidential
17 designations or for a protective order must include a certification, in the motion or in a declaration
18 or affidavit, that the movant has engaged in a good faith meet and confer conference with other
19 affected parties in an effort to resolve the dispute without court action. The certification must list
20 the date, manner, and participants to the conference. A good faith effort to confer requires a face-
21 to-face meeting or a telephone conference.

22 6.3 Judicial Intervention. If the parties cannot resolve a challenge without court
23 intervention, the designating party may file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality under Local
24 Civil Rule 7 (and in compliance with Local Civil Rule 5(g), if applicable). The burden of
25 persuasion in any such motion shall be on the designating party. Frivolous challenges, and those
26 made for an improper purpose (*e.g.*, to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on

other parties) may expose the challenging party to sanctions. All parties shall continue to maintain the material in question as confidential until the court rules on the challenge.

7. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION

If a party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL –SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER,” that party must:

(a) promptly notify the designating party in writing and include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

(b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this agreement. Such notification shall include a copy of this agreement; and

(c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the designating party whose confidential material may be affected.

8. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

If a receiving party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed confidential material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this agreement, the receiving party must immediately (a) notify in writing the designating party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the protected material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this agreement, and (d) request that such person or persons execute the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

9. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL

When a producing party gives notice to receiving parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the

1 receiving parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision
2 is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order or
3 agreement that provides for production without prior privilege review. The parties agree to the
4 entry of a non-waiver order under Fed. R. Evid. 502(d) as set forth herein.

5 10. NON TERMINATION AND RETURN OF DOCUMENTS

6 Except to the extent a party is required, by internal procedures, regulation, or other law, to
7 retain confidential material, within 60 days after the termination of this action, including all appeals,
8 each receiving party must return all confidential material to the producing party, including all
9 copies, extracts and summaries thereof. Alternatively, the parties may agree upon appropriate
10 methods of destruction.

11 Notwithstanding this provision, counsel are entitled to retain one archival copy of all
12 documents filed with the court, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, correspondence,
13 deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work
14 product, even if such materials contain confidential material.

15 The confidentiality obligations imposed by this agreement shall remain in effect until a
16 designating party agrees otherwise in writing or a court orders otherwise.

17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26

1 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

2 DATED: April 18, 2024

/s/ Ray C. Brooks

Attorneys for Plaintiff

BROOKS LAW FIRM

Ray C. Brooks, WSBA # 37768

8201 64th Ave. NE, Suite 200

Redmond, WA 98052

Tel: (425) 296-9025

ray@lawyerbrooks.com

7 DATED: April 18, 2024

/s/ T. Arlen Rumsey

Attorneys for Defendant

GORDON & POLSCER, L.L.C.

T. Arlen Rumsey, WSBA # 19048

Austin Smith, WSBA # 59487

1700 Seventh Ave., Suite 2100

Seattle, WA 98101

Tel: (206) 223-4226

arumsey@gordon-polscer.com

asmith@gordon-polscer.com

15 PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED

17 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that pursuant to Fed. R. Evid. 502(d), the production of any
18 documents, electronically stored information (ESI) or other information, whether inadvertent or
19 otherwise, in this proceeding shall not, for the purposes of this proceeding or any other federal or
20 state proceeding, constitute a waiver by the producing party of any privilege applicable to those
21 documents, including the attorney-client privilege, attorney work-product protection, or any other
22 privilege or protection recognized by law. This Order shall be interpreted to provide the maximum
23 protection allowed by Fed. R. Evid. 502(d). The provisions of Fed. R. Evid. 502(b) do not apply.
24 Nothing contained herein is intended to or shall serve to limit a party's right to conduct a review
25 of documents, ESI or other information (including metadata) for relevance, responsiveness and/or
26 segregation of privileged and/or protected information before production. Information produced

1 in discovery that is protected as privileged or work product shall be immediately returned to the
2 producing party.

3
4 DATED on this 22nd day of April 2024.

5
6
7 

8 David G. Estudillo
9 United States District Judge
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26

EXHIBIT AACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [print or type full name], of
 _____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of
 perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was
 issued by the United States District Court for the Western District of Washington on [date] in the
 case of _____ *Grigoriu v. Atlantic Casualty Insurance Company*, United States
 District Court for the Western District of Washington at Tacoma, Case No. 3:23-cv-06114-DGE.
 I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I
 understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and
 punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner
 any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity
 except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the
 Western District of Washington for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective
 Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

Date: _____

City and State where sworn and signed: _____

Printed name: _____

Signature: _____